



SHALOM HARTMAN מכון  
INSTITUTE שלום הרטמן

# iEngage Together & Apart

Session Ten  
COURSE SUMMARY  
*At-Homeness*

# *Our iEngage Journey*

1. From No Homes to Two Homes

2. Judaism of Being

3. Judaism of Becoming

4. Universalism and Particularism

5. Nationalism

6. Antisemitism

7. Dual Loyalty

8. Identity Politics

9. New Relationship Models

10. Conclusion: At-Homeness



מכון שלום הרטמן  
SHALOM HARTMAN INSTITUTE

**Part I: What is Jewish Peoplehood?**



**Part II: Contemporary Challenges to Peoplehood**



**Part III: New Models for the Relationship**



מכון שלום הרטמן  
SHALOM HARTMAN INSTITUTE

# 1. From No Homes to Two Homes

The Jewish People are the **story** we tell about ourselves.

Do we need a new grand narrative, a new meta-story, of Jewish Peoplehood today?



# Safety ✧ Normalcy ✧ Exceptionalism

## Numbers 23:9-10

<sup>9</sup>As I see them from the mountain tops,  
Gaze on them from the heights,  
Behold, there is a people that dwells apart,  
Not reckoned among the nations,  
<sup>10</sup>Who can count the dust of Jacob,  
Number the dust-cloud of Israel?  
May I die the death of the upright,  
May my fate be like theirs!

הו-עם לבדד ישכון



# *Galut & Geulah:* EXILE AND REDEMPTION

North American Jews  
reject the narrative  
that they are in exile,  
awaiting redemption  
by returning to Israel.

What happens with  
Jews feel fully at home  
(safe *and* exceptional)  
in the Diaspora?

Can Jewish  
peoplehood be  
sustained in a reality  
of two homes?



## 2. Judaism of Being

### Genesis 12:1-3

The Lord said to Abram, “Go forth from your native land and from your father’s house to the land that I will show you.

I will make of you a great nation (*goy gadol*) וְאֶעֱשֶׂךָ לְגוֹי גָּדוֹל

And I will bless you;

I will make your name great,

And you shall be a blessing.

### Passover Haggadah, Four Sons

The wicked one, what does he say? “What is this service to you?” He says “to you” but not to him! By thus excluding himself from the community he has committed heresy [“rebelled against the essence”].

רָשָׁע מָה הוּא אוֹמֵר? מָה הָעֲבֹדָה הַזֹּאת לָכֶם? לָכֶם - וְלֹא לוֹ.

וּלְפִי שֶׁהוֹצִיא אֶת עַצְמוֹ מִן הַכָּלל כָּפַר בְּעַקֵּר.



# 3. Judaism of Becoming

## Exodus 19:4-6

Now then, if you will obey Me faithfully and keep My covenant, you shall be My treasured possession among all the peoples. Indeed, all the earth is Mine, but you shall be to Me a kingdom of priests and a holy nation.

וְעַתָּה אִם־שָׁמוֹעַ תִּשְׁמָעוּ בְּקוֹלִי וּשְׁמַרְתֶּם אֶת־בְּרִיתִי וְהִיִּיתֶם לִי סֻגְלָה מִכָּל־הָעַמִּים  
כִּי־לִי כָל־הָאָרֶץ : וְאַתֶּם תִּהְיוּ־לִי מְמַלְכֶת כֹּהֲנִים וְגוֹי קָדוֹשׁ

## Isaiah 42:6-7

I the Lord, in My grace, have summoned you,  
And I have grasped you by the hand.  
I created you, and appointed you  
A covenant people, a light of nations

אֲנִי יְהוָה קְרָאתִיךָ בְּצֶדֶק וְאַחֲזַק בְּיָדְךָ וְאַצְרֶךָ וְאַתֶּנֶּךָ לְבְרִית עִם לְאוּר גּוֹיִם:





## JUDAISM OF BEING

People  
Nation  
Family  
Ethnicity  
Belonging  
Solidarity/Obligation  
“Genesis Jews”  
Unconditional Covenant  
JUDAISM is WHO YOU ARE

## JUDAISM OF BECOMING

Religion  
Beliefs  
Practices  
Torah  
Mitzvot  
Mission  
“Exodus Jews”  
Conditional Covenant  
JUDAISM is WHAT YOU DO



# Donniel Hartman

*“The Jewish people are healthier, stronger, and more vibrant when the Covenant of Being and Becoming dance together.”*

This dance is not merely the story of Jewish peoplehood over the ages, but a blueprint for our future.”



מכון שאלום הרטמן  
SHALOM HARTMAN  
INSTITUTE

## 4. Universalism and Particularism

### Genesis 1:27

*And God created man in His image. In the image of God He created him. Male and female he created them.*

וַיִּבְרָא אֱלֹהִים אֶת-הָאָדָם בְּצַלְמוֹ, בְּצֶלֶם אֱלֹהִים בָּרָא אֹתוֹ: זָכָר וּנְקֵבָה, בָּרָא אֹתָם.

### Mishnah Sanhedrin 4:5

For this reason was humanity created singly (one at a time), to teach you that whoever destroys a single soul, Scripture imputes [guilt] to that person as though he or she had destroyed a complete world; and whoever preserves a single soul, Scripture ascribes [merit] to that person as though he or she had preserved a complete world. Furthermore, [humanity was created singly] for the sake of peace among people, that one might not say another, my ancestor was greater than yours.



# The Biblical Story as an Hourglass

Universalism → Particularism → Universalism



SHALOM HARTMAN מכון  
INSTITUTE שלום הרטמן

## “From Part to Whole” (Sissela Bok)

...But here a new question arises: **If both perspectives are important** in education [i.e., the cosmopolitan and the particularistic], **which one should be given priority**, at least from the point of view of when it is first introduced? Or, to use the metaphor from the concentric circles, in which direction might children’s learning about inner and outer circles and the respective allegiances best develop? Is it better for parents and teachers to begin at the outer edges and move inward, to move back and forth between the two, or to begin with the inner circles and move outwards?

Alexander Pope offers one answer, in “An Essay on Man”:

**God loves from Whole to Parts: but human soul**

**Must rise from Individual to the Whole.**



מכון שאלום הרטמן  
SHALOM HARTMAN INSTITUTE

# ***Particularism does not mean self-interest and moral chauvinism***

## **Exodus 23:9**

You shall not oppress a stranger, for you know the feelings of the stranger, having yourselves been strangers in the land of Egypt.

פִּיגְרִים הֵייתֶם בְּאֶרֶץ מִצְרָיִם:





## 5. Nationalism and Encumberedness

***Nations Prioritize!***

Citizenship  
Health Care  
Education  
Welfare



מכון שאלום הרטמן  
SHALOM HARTMAN INSTITUTE

## Deuteronomy 15:1-2

Every seventh year you shall practice remission of debts. This shall be the nature of the remission: every creditor shall remit the due that he claims from his fellow; he shall not dun his fellow or kinsman, for the remission proclaimed is of the Lord. You may dun the foreigner; but you must remit whatever is due you from your kinsmen.

## Leviticus 19:17-18; 33-34

<sup>17</sup>You shall not hate your brethren in your heart. Reprove your kinsman but incur no guilt because of him. <sup>18</sup>You shall not take vengeance or bear a grudge against your countrymen. Love your neighbor as yourself: I am the LORD...

<sup>33</sup>When a stranger resides with you in your land, you shall not wrong him. <sup>34</sup>The stranger who resides with you shall be to you as one of your citizens; you shall love him as yourself, for you were strangers in the land of Egypt: I the LORD am your God.

לֹא-תִשָּׂנֵא אֶת-**אַחִידְךָ**, בְּלִבְבְּךָ; הֹכֵחַ תּוֹכִיחַ אֶת-**עַמִּיתְךָ**, וְלֹא-תִשָּׂא עָלָיו חֶטְא. **יח** לֹא-  
תִקָּם וְלֹא-תִטּוֹר אֶת-**בְּנֵי עַמְּךָ**, וְאֶהְבֶּתָ לְרֵעֲךָ כָּמוֹךָ: **אָנִי**, ה'... **לֹג וְכִי-יִגְוֹר אֶתְּךָ גֵּר**,  
בְּאַרְצְכֶם--לֹא תוֹנוּ, אֹתוֹ. **לֹד כְּאֶזְרָח** מִכֶּם יִהְיֶה לָכֶם הַגֵּר הַגֵּר אֶתְכֶם, וְאֶהְבֶּתָ לוֹ כָּמוֹךָ--  
**כִּי-גֵרִים הֵייתֶם**, בְּאֶרֶץ מִצְרַיִם: **אָנִי**, יְהוָה אֱלֹהֵיכֶם.





# DISTINCTION BETWEEN PRIORITIZATION AND DISCRIMINATION

## “Menschlicht” Nationalism

Self-Interest has many meanings:

- Physical safety and prosperity
- Spiritual and moral aspiration
- Sacrifice for a greater purpose



## 6. Antisemitism and Collective Jewish Identity

- ❖ **Shared suffering** and the shared fight against antisemitism always served as a **unifying force** for Jewish people.
- ❖ Today, however, there is an internal debate among Jews on the political left and the political right about how to identify and fight against antisemitism.



# Antisemitism as Eternal/Transnational or Local/Contextual?

## Passover Haggadah, *V'Hi She'Amdah*

And it is this that has stood for our ancestors and for us, since it is not [only] one [person or nation] that has stood [against] us to destroy us, but rather in each generation, they stand [against] us to destroy us, but the Holy One, blessed be He, rescues us from their hand.

וְהִיא שֶׁעָמְדָה לְאַבוֹתֵינוּ וְלָנוּ. שֶׁלֹא אֶחָד בְּלֶבֶד עָמַד עָלֵינוּ לְכַלּוֹתֵנוּ,  
אֶלָּא שֶׁבְּכָל דּוֹר וָדוֹר עוֹמְדִים עָלֵינוּ לְכַלּוֹתֵנוּ, וְהַקְדוֹשׁ בְּרוּךְ הוּא מַצִּילֵנוּ מִיָּדָם.

## Passover Haggadah, *B'chol Dor va'Dor*

In each and every generation, a person is obligated to see himself as if he left Egypt.

בְּכָל־דּוֹר וָדוֹר חַיֵּב אָדָם לִרְאוֹת אֶת־עַצְמוֹ כְּאִלּוּ הוּא יָצָא מִמִּצְרַיִם.



# Boundaries of Judaism

<u>PLURALISM</u>	<u>TOLERANCE</u>	<u>DEVIANCE</u>
Equally valid Mutual respect  <i>Multiple options</i>	Wrong and inferior  <i>but tolerable:</i> doesn't destroy collective life	Intolerable, Harmful, Unacceptable, Deviant <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>• Red Lines</li><li>• Sanctions</li><li>• Exclusions</li></ul>

## Shared Definition of Deviance?

1. Assessment of threat
2. Complex multiple identities
3. Partisan politics



# 7. Accusation of Dual Loyalty



Esther 3:8–11

וַיֹּאמֶר הָמָן, לַמֶּלֶךְ אַחֲשֵׁרוּשׁ--יִשְׁנֹו  
עַם-אֶחָד מְפֹזָר וּמִפְּרָד בֵּין הָעַמִּים,  
בְּכָל מְדִינֹת מַלְכוּתְךָ; וְדִתִּיהֶם שְׁנוֹת  
מִכָּל-עַם, וְאֶת-דִּתֵּי הַמֶּלֶךְ אֵינָם  
עֹשִׂים, וְלַמֶּלֶךְ אֵין-שׁוּהָ, לְהִנָּחֵם.




Haman then said to King Ahasuerus, “There is a certain people, scattered and dispersed among the other peoples in all the provinces of your realm, whose laws are different from those of any other people and who do not obey the king's laws; and it is not in Your Majesty's interest to tolerate them.



# The Paradox of Dual Loyalty

The Jewish People believe essentially the ***same thing*** that forms the basis of our enemies' accusations!

1. We are a transnational people, spanning national borders
2. We cross ethnic, racial, ideological and political lines
3. We feel a sense of loyalty to the Jewish people across these boundaries



The difference is that we believe it does not come at the cost of being loyal citizens of the places in which we live.



## The Assembly of Jewish Notables (1806)

**Resolved, by the French deputies  
professing the religion of Moses ...**

*Yes, France is our country; all Frenchmen are  
our brethren...*

The love of the country is in the heart of  
Jews a sentiment so natural, so powerful,  
and so consonant to their religious  
opinions, that a French Jew considers  
himself in England as among strangers,  
although he may be among Jews; and the  
case is the same with English Jews in  
France.



SHALOM HARTMAN מכון  
INSTITUTE שלום הרטמן

## Louis Brandeis, “The Jewish Problem: How to Solve It” (1915)

### No DAYLIGHT

“Let no American imagine that Zionism is inconsistent with Patriotism. Multiple loyalties are objectionable only if they are inconsistent.”

“Indeed, loyalty to America demands rather that each American Jew become a Zionist.”





# Loyalty and Disloyalty

What does it mean  
to be loyal to  
America?

What does it mean  
to be loyal to Israel?



As internal Jewish  
debates intensify, other  
Americans will start to  
interpret Jewish  
arguments about  
America and Israel  
through the framework  
of disloyalty.



## 8. Identity Politics

Throughout history American Jews have adopted different strategies to answer the question:

“What is good for the Jews?”



**Phase One:** (Late 19<sup>th</sup> –Early 20<sup>th</sup> Cent.)

Fight for the rights of ALL

**Phase Two:** (post-1960 Identity Politics)

Fighting for own GROUP INTEREST

**Phase Three:** (Today)

Disagree about **Power** and **Vulnerability**



מכון שאלום הרטמן  
SHALOM HARTMAN INSTITUTE

# Soviet Jewry Rally, San Francisco 1983



מכון שאלום הרטמן  
SHALOM HARTMAN INSTITUTE

# Tree of Life Shooting, Pittsburgh 2018



## יתגדל ויתקדש שמה רבה...

These are the first words of the Jewish mourners' prayer, 'Magnified and sanctified be Your name,' to be recited tonight on the first Sabbath since the tragedy at Tree of Life



מכון שאלום הרטמן  
SHALOM HARTMAN  
INSTITUTE

## 9. Relationship Models

Family

Fellow Believers

Partners

Investors

Consumers



# Israel-World Jewry Relationship

Model  
of  
Family



“We are  
One.”



מכון שלום הרטמן  
SHALOM HARTMAN  
INSTITUTE

# Mismatching Models

What happens when one community see Jewishness predominantly in terms of the **family model**, while the other increasingly adopts a **consumerist** perspective?

As family, Israelis expect *loyalty* from North American Jews

As consumers, North American Jews are asking same questions of Israel that they *demand* of their own institutions.



מכון שאלום הרטמן  
SHALOM HARTMAN INSTITUTE



# Shared Believers?

Can these core beliefs about Zionism still serve to unite the Jewish community in North America around support for Israel?

**Safety**

**Jewish  
Excellence**



SHALOM HARTMAN מכון  
INSTITUTE שלום הרטמן

# New Relationship Models?

What happens if we no longer feel like a family, and we no longer share the same beliefs?

Can we conceive of new models?



# PARTNERSHIP PARADIGM

Responsibility

Covenantal Mutuality

Humility

What happens if Israel wants FAMILY and  
North American Jews want PARTNERSHIP?



# Abraham as God's Partner

## Genesis 12:1

*The Lord said to Abram, "Go forth from your native land and from your father's house to the land that I will show you."*

## Genesis 18:23-25

Abraham came forward and said, "Will You sweep away the innocent along with the guilty? ... Far be it from You to do such a thing, to bring death upon the innocent as well as the guilty, so that innocent and guilty fare alike. Far be it from You! Shall not the Judge of all the earth deal justly?!"

## Genesis Rabbah 30:10

And to what is Abraham comparable? To the friend of a king who saw the king walking through dark alleyways; when the friend saw this, he shone a light for him through the window. The king looked up and saw him, and he said, "Instead of lighting my way through the window, come and light the way before me." So, too, did the Holy One, blessed be God, say to Abraham, "Instead of shining a light for Me from Mesopotamia and its environs, come and light the way before Me in the Land of Israel."



# 10. At-Homeness

Judaism is a story of “journey” rather than “arrival.”

How do the Jewish people come home?

What does it feel like?

How does it obligate us?

How do we deal with the fact that we have arrived at home both in Israel and North America?



# Resisting At-Homeness?

You are more accountable to a place when you are an ***owner***, especially when you have enormous amounts of ***power and privilege***.



מכון שלום הרטמן  
SHALOM HARTMAN INSTITUTE

# Unfamiliarity



Israelis and North Americans are unfamiliar and confusing to one another!



Over time, even family members who find themselves at home in **different ethnic, cultural, and political milieu** will stop recognizing one other as easily as they once did!



# Yehuda Kurtzer, Four Principles

1. Mutual thriving (our fates are tied together)
2. At-homeness is not a ZERO-SUM game (home *and* homeland)
3. No equal standing in both places
4. Do not waste this moment in history!





# Multiple Homes: Ancient Feature of Jewish Belonging

## Philo of Alexandria, *Flaccus*

For no one country can contain the whole Jewish nation, by reason of its populousness; on which account they frequent all the most prosperous and fertile countries of Europe and Asia, whether islands or continents, looking indeed upon the holy city as their metropolis in which is erected the sacred temple of the most high God, but accounting those regions which have been occupied by their fathers, and grandfathers, and great grandfathers, and still more remote ancestors, in which they have been born and brought up, as their country.



# Together & Apart

Together and Apart is not a new phenomenon in Jewish history.

Jews were always together and apart!

“Together and Apart” is an *aspiration*, a call to build a strong sense of Jewish peoplehood which can be together in a meaningful way, despite our being apart in so many other ways.



מכון שאלום הרטמן  
SHALOM HARTMAN INSTITUTE

# Donniel Hartman

Israel needs to  
change its  
narrative.

“We are too often  
functioning within the  
one-home paradigm of  
a singular family with  
young children.”



SHALOM HARTMAN מכון  
INSTITUTE שלום הרטמן

# Principles of Multiple Homes

If Israel is to fulfill its responsibility as a homeland, it must make World Jewry feel at home.

That does not mean that World Jewry should have a vote on Israeli policies.

However, they need to see a space where they feel welcomed, respected, and valued.

***North American Jews need to exercise self-restraint.*** They need to hear what Israelis feel and take into account how they want to conduct life in their home.

We need to ***relinquish the hierarchical assumptions*** that each of us often has toward the other, that our home is the principal home, the better home, the more modern home.

